

REPORT ON THE APPLICATION IN GALIZA OF THE EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES

A Mesa pola Normalización Lingüística. October 2014

1. INTRODUCTION:

A MESA pola Normalización Lingüística (Board for Linguistic Normalisation) is an independent and plural association founded in 1986 to defend the Galician language. Both in terms of its membership and its activities, it is the largest cultural association in Galiza and an essential reference for society in the field of language normalisation. One of our lines of work involves providing advice and information and processing complaints and congratulations regarding Galician language rights. Complaints sent in by citizens are the main source we used to draw up this report.

Some general remarks are necessary before going on to discuss the articles of the Charter. In particular, there is a need to highlight the bias and the lack of rigor and accuracy contained in the information presented by the Spanish government in its *Fourth report concerning compliance with the European Charter*, since at least the part dealing with Galician gives in many cases partial information and half-truths¹.

1. The information provided by the Government regarding the **number of Galician speakers** in the *Fourth report concerning compliance with the European Charter* is confusing, providing a static picture and deliberately avoiding comparing the data with previous studies in order to show how the situation has evolved over time. The figures contained in the Sociolinguistic Map of Galiza (volumes covering 1992 and 2004) published by the Galician Royal Academy and the study carried out by the Council for Galician Culture (Sociolinguistic evolution 1992-2008) analysing the data provided by the Galician Institute for Statistics (IGE) alluded to in the Fourth report drawn up by the Spanish State as compared with earlier data, all indicate that since the first reliable study in 1992, Spanish has steadily continued oust Galician due to the fact that it is not handed down from one generation to the next and to language attrition within generations of speakers. The only clearly positive data involves the undeniable improvement in the level of language skills as perceived by the speakers themselves, easily explainable in terms of the low starting point reflected in the

¹ For reasons of space, it is impossible here to detail all cases. For example, in many cases, the Spanish Government report indicates real progress for Galician, despite the lack of any actions carried out by the Government itself. The fact that Twitter (<http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/446>) and other social networks are now available in Galician, as well as the recent creation of on-line newspapers and local radio stations committed to Galician (<http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/94>), is not thanks to Government policies, but to the selfless work of sectors of civil society committed to ensuring a future for Galician.

earliest studies which indicated that the older generations had a high level of illiteracy in Galician, having learnt to read and write at a time when Galician was banned from schools.

Despite minor differences, all of the studies indicate that Galician is the language which has suffered the sharpest drop of all of the languages with official status in the Spanish State, with the number of people who never use Galician doubling and the language used all but rarely by young people in the towns and cities. It is clear, therefore, that the languages policies applied over the last decades have failed to ensure the recuperation of the Galician language.

2. In the report submitted by the Spanish State for the Fourth assessment, the General Secretariat for Language Policy (SXPL) acknowledges a drastic drop in its budget for the period in question, from 15,572,633 € in 2010 to 5,724,478 in 2013. The same year that the current Galician government came to power in 2009, the budget was in the order of 21.5 million euros involving a cut of over 73% for the protection and promotion of Galician², setting an all-time low which cannot be explained or justified by the prevailing economic climate, with no other Galician Government Department affected by similar cut-backs. The reasons are clearly political, with the government cutting off economic resources in order to stifle Galician, along with other political and legal measures.

3. The Spanish State claims that the General Secretariat for language Policy includes “all of the information” concerning the Charter on its website. However, this site only includes links to the second assessment report (2006)³, hiding the *Third report* drafted by the Committee of Experts owing to its negative assessment concerning regression in education. When NGOs made the conclusions of this report public⁴, the Galician Government made accusations in the press that the Committee of Experts lied in their Third Report⁵. We believe this breaches the terms of **Article 6** of the Charter by **withholding information from the public** regarding the rights and duties described therein. In particular, the Galician Government fails to inform parents who wish to educate their children in Galician of their legal rights covered by the Charter.

² Affecting the use of Galician in all sectors of society, from education, local administration, business and media, etc., and paralysing all promotional measures undertaken in the Charter.

³ [2º Informe periódico de España sobre a aplicación en España da Carta Europea das Linguas Rexionais e Minoritarias](#), (2006) and the [2º Informe final do Comité de Ministros do Consello de Europa, sobre a aplicación en España da Carta Europea das Linguas Rexionais e Minoritarias \(en inglés\)](#).

⁴ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/358>

⁵ <http://praza.gal/politica/5008/a-xunta-acusa-o-consello-de-europa-de-mentir-sobre-galicia-no-seu-informe-linguistico/>

2. FAILURES TO COMPLY WITH THE TERMS IN THE CHARTER

ARTICLE 8. EDUCATION

Paragraph 1. The commitments undertaken in **a.i)**, **b.i)** and **c.i)** remain unfulfilled, as already stated in the previous assessment. Teaching mainly in Galician is still not offered at all three levels of education and the Galician Government has failed to attend to the “strong instance” expressed the Committee of Experts in the previous report, having done nothing to provide education in Galician for those who request it. Over this period, the repeal of Decree 124/2007 making provision for nursery education in Galician and setting a minimum of 50% for teaching in Galician for all levels of compulsory education, including vocational training and A-levels, replaced by Decree 79/2010 has had a very negative impact by setting a maximum of 50% for teaching in Galician, with the final aim of further reducing it to one third, whilst at the same time expressly forbidding the teaching of Mathematics in primary education and Mathematics, Technology and Physics and Chemistry in secondary education. The effects were felt hardest in preschool education in the towns and cities. The ‘Galiscolas’, a network of nursery schools specifically designed to provide basic teaching in Galician, were replaced by the so-called ‘Blue Chicken’ (Galiña Azul) schools in 2010, whilst at the same time phasing out the pilot programs in linguistic immersion, effectively excluding Galician from many nursery schools in the towns and cities. One study carried out by the Board for Language Normalisation (Mesa pola Normalización Lingüística) reveals that Galician is present in no more than 6.57% of nursery schools in towns with over 50,000 inhabitants, rising to 50% in 2,41%. In response, the Galician Government itself claimed that teaching in Galician did not exceed 10%, a figure considerably lower than the actual percentage of speakers and lower than the real demand for teaching in Galician within society⁶. The campaigns designed to raise awareness among teachers and parents have been phased out and the smear campaign launched by the Galician Government against the former Decree further strengthened existing prejudices against Galician, claiming it to be “uselessness” in comparison with English.

Support and funding for the Language Normalisation and Dynamisation Teams in schools were slashed, from 1 million € in 2009 to 300, 000 € in 2014.

LOMCE education reform was adopted, making it compulsory for the Government to guarantee teaching completely in Spanish to parents who request it, opening the door for students not to know the language of the country where they live and all of

⁶ <http://praza.gal/politica/7396/a-rag-urxe-a-xunta-a-atallar-o-deterioro-do-galego-no-ensino/>

this pedagogical nonsense is paid at the tax-payer's expense. In the meantime, parents who do want to school their children mainly in Galician are not allowed to.

The teaching materials for the *Abalar* project for integrating ICTs into education in Galiza are not available in Galician for many subjects required to be taught in Galician according to the terms of the Decree currently in force.

d. i) This undertaking has not been fulfilled. No teaching material is available in Galician for most of the vocational training courses, making it impossible to comply with Charter and Decree 79/2010..

Galician is also completely excluded from distance vocational training, affecting almost 5,000 students. The situation is so serious that in December 2013 the Galician Government removed the few materials that were edited in Galician from the distance training platform, replacing them with materials in Spanish.

f. i) The availability of language courses for adults has become precarious, particularly since 2013 when Galician Government unlawfully dismissed the specialised CELGA teachers, since declared void in over 10 sentences. These courses are longer run in collaboration with municipal governments, obstructing students' participation. No specific language courses exists in order to improve skills and to promote Galician in areas such as journalism, advertising, business, associations, healthcare, etc.

In addition to the lack of Galician language courses, no measures exist to guarantee that the rest of the courses for adults and lifelong learning is carried out mainly in Galician, as stated in this article of the Charter, whereby we consider that **this undertaking is not being fulfilled**.

g) The recent approval of the LOMCE education reform, intentionally designed to "bring more Spanish" into the education system in the words of the Minister for Education, marks a step backwards regarding compliance with this section by centralising syllabus design in in Madrid and reducing the leeway for the Autonomous Communities to adjust the curriculum to fit their historical and cultural realities.

h) This is another of the undertakings that remains unfulfilled, with lifelong teacher training unavailable in order to facilitate the implementation of the undertakings of the Charter. Although Article 16 of Decree 79/2010 states that the authorities are required to design a training program for teachers in order to ensure that all teachers have sufficient oral and written skills to communicate and carry out their work in Galician and to be aware of the situation in Galiza, there is still no specific offer for lifelong teacher training aimed at improving language proficiency.

i) The Galician Government actively and systematically refuses to fulfil this undertaking, having failed to draft or make public any official report assessing the situation and the consequences caused by regressive measures taken by the Government in the area of education regarding the Galician language.

Since Decree 79/2010 came into force, teachers, grassroots organisations, political parties and concerned parents have repeatedly requested information regarding this issue and a proper assessment of the impact this Decree is having on Galician in education, with no response from the Administration. Only following the presentation of the study carried out by *A Mesa* concerning the elimination of Galician in nursery education in the cities did Galician Government release percentages regarding the use of Galician at the different levels of educational, whilst at the same time withholding data, sources and methodology in order to prevent cross-checking⁷. This was by no means a proper assessment, but mere propaganda and everyone involved in knows that the percentages are implausible⁸. In a speech at the Galician Parliament, the head of the Galician Government Department for Education went so far as to claim that he had no legal obligation to make this information public, thereby denying the commitment undertaken in this section of the Charter.

Contrary to the report for the Spanish State, the inspection system is not fulfilling this task, because the data collected via the XADE programme are no more than bureaucratic information and should not be considered a real and reliable assessment of the presence of Galician in education, in as much as schools need only indicate that they intend to comply with the law when using this computer application. The Government refuses to provide independent studies.

Paragraph 2. Although it cannot be said that this section is not fulfilled, nevertheless, language assistants who account for the main bulk of people teaching Galician in universities outside Galiza carry out their work in precariousness conditions created by the General Secretariat for Language Policy (SXPL).

ARTICLE 9. JUSTICE

Paragraph 1, Sections a.i), b.i) and c.i) are clearly not fulfilled. The Government has ignored the recommendations of the Committee of Experts in this area. It is clear that nothing has been done to correct the legal framework in order to allow the

⁷ <http://praza.gal/politica/7416/a-xunta-rexeita-que-o-galego-se-reduza-no-ensino-pero-negase-a-publicar-os-datos/>

⁸ <http://praza.gal/politica/7551/a-xunta-manten-que-o-galego-e-maioritario-en-primaria-e-bacharelato/>

judicial authorities from the criminal, civil and administrative areas to develop processes in Galician at the request of one of the parties, as stated in the report presented in the Fourth assessment by the Spanish Government invoking Article 231 of the Law of Judiciary to point out that the use of Galician is **voluntary** for judges, prosecutors, etc., provided that any of the other parties do not oppose it. In practice, this is incompatible with the citizens' right to request that the judicial procedure be carried out in their language, as contained in the European Charter. Examples of this abound in the Galician courts which fail to respect the express wishes of the person concerned for the notification procedure to be conducted in their own language.

Section iv) remains unfulfilled. In most cases, even if there is an explicit request, the court clerk will refuse to provide the parties with sentences or notifications regarding the procedure in Galician. We have copies of resolutions from the General Council of the Spanish Judiciary defending the Registrar's refusal to provide court sentences or notifications in Galician to those who request it.

Knowledge of Galician is not still a requirement to serve as a judge, prosecutor or registrar in Galiza. However, the absence of Galician from the area of justice, accounting for only 5% of sentences, is due not only to the refusal use the language or to a lack of language proficiency on the part of the majority of the judiciary and the public prosecutor, but often the Administration itself that hinders the use of Galician. One clear example is the *Minerva* computer application that must be used on all courts, requiring an extra workload of 40% for those people want to do their jobs in Galician, with all of the processes having to be done by hand, including translating laws, documents and forms. Due to their already heavy workload this is often unfeasible, turning to Spanish instead. Nevertheless, in its report the Spanish Government doesn't hesitate to claim the full implementation of this application as a success when, in fact, it is the main obstacle for many people who might want to use Galician in the courts. Furthermore, Galician Government has halted the inclusion of models of documents in Galician into this application and the more the application is updated, the harder it becomes to use in Galician.

Paragraph 3. This undertaking is still not fulfilled. In the previous assessment report, the Committee noted the key texts have only been published in Galician the Spanish Official Gazette only since 1998, with a delay of more than three months, such that new legislation could only be accessed in Spanish. However, the texts translated at that time are unusable because they only exist in their preliminary drafts rather than their final versions. Today, practically no up-to-date versions of any legal texts are available in Galician, be it in hard copy, electronic format or database. The updated versions used by the courts, paid for by the Galician Government and the Spanish Government, are provided in Spanish only.

We can conclude that the regulations adopted by the Spanish Government are insufficient to ensure compliance with the Charter in the field of justice. It is not

accompanied by any monitoring or control mechanisms and is not supported by the human and material resources necessary to render it operational, in line with the current use of new technologies by the courts. We would like to stress that the legal bodies of the State and the Autonomous Region themselves systematically violate the terms of the Charter⁹, systematically breaching the right of citizens resident in Galiza to have legal proceedings conducted in Galician and, when this right is respected, always involves an undue delay in the resolution of their case.

Article 10. ADMINISTRATIVE AUTHORITIES AND PUBLIC SERVICES

Paragraph 1.

a.i) The problems indicated regarding the fulfilment of this objective by the Government described in the previous report of the Committee of Experts not only remain unfulfilled but have experienced major setbacks¹⁰.

The removal of the Central Government Council of Official Languages set up during the previous parliamentary term stands as the first proof of a clear U-turn on the part of the Spanish Government, accompanied by other regressive measures restricting access to ministry and Central Government agency websites in Galician. Following a major overhaul, most of these sites now only offer presentations or static information in Galician, allowing no other actions and failing to provide the possibility to address them in Galician. The implementation of e-government is creating significant difficulties regarding the right to use Galician before the State authorities and today procedures which could be carried out in Galician only a few years ago without any problems at local headquarters can no longer be performed in Galician and it is not even possible to submit documents in this language.

Over this period, there have been very serious cases when the Central Government has refused to accept documents submitted in Galician¹¹, e.g., dozens of students were denied postgraduate scholarships because their degree certificates were in Galician¹². Nor have steps been taken to ensure and advance language training for State officials, as indicated the previous assessment.

⁹ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/291>

¹⁰ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/506>

¹¹ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/589>

¹² <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/592>

We have evidence that many of the State administrations operating in Galiza refuse to process documents and dossiers in Galician even specifically requested to do, effectively breaching a right recognised in law.

b) This aim remains to be achieved and significant setbacks have been detected in this regard. Documents and forms previously available Galician until recently, are now only available in Spanish. This is particularly striking in the case of the Tax Agency which removed some of the commonly used forms available until recently in Galician from its website. Even in cases where models do exist in the different official languages, the State Administration currently only distributes versions in Spanish, refusing to provide copies in Galician upon request.

c) Serious problems exist when addressing the State Administration in Galician, particularly via electronic portals which do not generally provide the option in Galician and do not accept documents in this language. This is a particular problem in the case of the Tax Office which all citizens have dealings with.

In 2013, the Galician Government signed an agreement with the Spanish army for the prevention of forest fires, whose first clause explicitly bars the use of Galician in any relationship with the army, following the Ministerial Order 35/1987 dated 17 June.

Paragraph 2. Major setbacks have also been detected regarding sections **a)** and **b)**:

In the section entitled section "Access to Civil Service and training", the report submitted by the State refers to the Law 2/2009 dated June 23. The truth is that this law was a step backwards regarding compliance with Article 10, as acknowledged by the Committee of Experts in its previous report (Paragraph 994), lowering the need for proof of knowledge of Galician when recruiting public administration staff by removing the requirement that access examinations include at least one test in Galician. Now a certificate of completion of a Galician course is deemed sufficient. As the knowledge of Galician is not verified, the citizens' right to be attended to routinely in the language cannot be guaranteed.

There have been verified breaches in the use of the Galician form of place names, which are the only legally recognised official forms, both on the part of various public authorities as well companies and other entities with public funding¹³.

¹³ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/564>

Over the period 2009-2013, the General Secretariat of Linguistic Policy budget for measures to promote Galician went from 21.5 million to 5.72 million euros, amounting to a reduction of over 73%.

In the area of local administration problems have been reported concerning the use of Galician by certain town councils¹⁴, with the almost complete removal of promotion policies. The privatization of council services and/or outsourcing to private companies means that many services are no longer carried out in Galician, even failing to provide the option to be attended in Galician.

Many council workers express themselves exclusively in Spanish and refuse to use Galician, despite the fact that this contravenes regulations and provisions approved by those same local authorities. Some of the largest town councils are characterized by a policy of excluding Galician, failing to use Galician as a working language.

Subsidies to local authorities for promoting Galician have been slashed. While the budget allocated for this purpose in 2005 was in the order of 751,266 € and 801,708 € in 2009, in recent years it has been reduced to half or less than half: 520,000 € for 2011-2012 (As in 2011. However, although having earmarked 420,000 € of its budget for this purpose, the Galician Government finally suspended the grants, effectively allocated 0 € for this purpose in 2011), and 400,000 € and 300,000 € in 2013 and 2014 respectively. What this has meant in practice is the closing of more than a third of the existing language normalisation services attached to the town councils.

The Galician Government no longer coordinates some of the activities promoted by language normalisation services attached to the town councils following the setting up of the Linguistic Dynamisation Network in 2011. This network mainly organises cultural activities in towns and cities (exhibitions, plays, story-telling, etc.), but does not run activities geared to language promotion in public administrative, business, , associations, etc. The fact that the General Secretariat for Language Planning uses the Linguistic Dynamisation Network to carry out its activities in the towns and cities means that it stopped promoting the already scarce joint interventions between different Language Normalization Services), leading to the closure of many of them and involving a real downturn in the actions to promote Galician within the local administration.

Paragraph 3. a) This undertaking is not fulfilled in most cases. One of the most widespread problems detected is that the privatisation of council services and/or outsourcing leads to a halt un the usage of Galician, without even providing the

¹⁴ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/516>; <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/514>

opportunity to be notified in Galician. The concessionary companies are not required to provide any assurances that they respect the citizens' language. In general, public services that depend upon the Spanish Government administration do not guarantee the provision of services in Galician.

Paragraph 4. b) Considerations formulated by the Committee of Experts in its previous report regarding the failure to meet this undertaking by the Spanish Government continue to be fully applicable, as nothing has changed for the better.

Paragraph 5. Despite legislative advances, there are still specific instances where certain registrars prevent the registration of family names in Galician.

ARTICLE 11. MEDIA

The percentage of use of Galician in the media is lower than in the Eighties. The number of media in Spanish has risen and state-run media have dramatically reduced their broadcasting in Galician.

Paragraph 1.

a. i) The amount of Galician in state television channel (TVE) broadcasts the continues to fall. The state radio channel (RNE) did nothing to recover the Galician broadcasts of Radio 4 and the remodelling of Radio 5 confirmed the removal of Galician from their local broadcasts.

The lack of commitment on the part of the state-run public media further aggravates the drop in the use of Galician in the media. The shortage and/or lack of Galician language programs for children and young people is of particular concern.

b.i) This goal is not being fulfilled. No private radio station broadcasts mainly in Galician. The use of Galician in existing stations in Galicia is negligible¹⁵.

c.i) This is not being fulfilled. Galician is never used in Spanish private television channels and in the only Galician private television the number of programs in Galician is very limited, with the Galician Government doing nothing to ensure that it meets the minimum of 50% established in the license.

¹⁵ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/94>

d) There have been significant cuts in promotion measures. Galician films such as *Vilamor* and *O Apóstolo* have experienced major problems regarding distribution in commercial cinemas¹⁶. Therefore, although production subsidies do exist, nothing is done to ensure the distribution of these audio-visual products.

The budget for voiceovers in the Galician Radio and Television Company (CRTVG) dropped from 3.3 million euros in 2012 to 1.5 million euros in 2013, and no films have been dubbed so far in 2014. Unemployment in the sector is almost total. The public Galician Television Channel (TVG) no longer broadcasts TV series or films produced in foreign languages, including children's films.

The Galician Government shows no interest in reaching agreements with private companies to provide the option to watch films or series dubbed or subtitled in Galician through DTT or commercial DVDs. The presence of Galician in this market is negligible¹⁷.

There is no support for the distribution of foreign films dubbed or subtitled in Galician in commercial cinemas and during this assessment period none were shown in cinemas in Galiza.

e.i) This undertaking is also not fulfilled. There is no daily paper published entirely in Galician and only one weekly, *Sermos Galiza*. The drastic cut in subsidies has led to the closure of the newspapers that did use Galician: *Galicía Hoxe* (completely in Galician, now only available on-line), *Xornal de Galicia* (approx. 40% in Galician) and *De Luns a Venres* all closed in 2011 and *A Nosa Terra* also went out of print.

It is not true that newspapers like *La Voz de Galicia* have a version in Galician in their website, in this case only offering a machine translation without human proofreading or editing, often resulting in garbled texts that are difficult and off-putting to read.

g) There is no line of action for the training of journalists and media personnel who use Galician.

Paragraph 2. It is impossible to receive Portuguese radio and television broadcasts in Galiza despite the linguistic and cultural proximity and despite Portugal's willingness to work together with the Spanish government to make this possible. The Spanish government has refused to listen to the requests of citizens in this regard.

¹⁶ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/284>; <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/253>

¹⁷ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/603>

ARTICLE 12. CULTURAL ACTIVITIES AND FACILITIES

Despite the fulfilment in previous years, albeit to a greater or lesser extent, of the obligations described in **Paragraph 1** of this article undertaken by the Galician Government, the cultural policy of the current government and the economic suffocation that it causes in the sector have led to very serious setbacks in this field:

Difficulties accessing and distributing of audio-visual products Galician in commercial cinemas.

Subsidies for translating to and from Galician have been reduced.

It is also worth stressing the difficulties for publishing in Galician and the lack of reaction of Galician Government in this regard, which continues to stifle the sector with a drastic policy of cut-backs. In this regard, we refer to the harsh report published by the Galician Association of Publishers in 2013 which indicated that in that year the number of books publishing in Galician had fallen by 30%¹⁸.

There is no action to increase the presence Galician in local festivals, often the main cultural activity in many Galician towns and villages¹⁹.

There also on-going difficulties involved in gaining access to cultural activities and facilities in Galician-speaking areas outside the Autonomous Community of Galiza.

Paragraph 3.

Barring occasional collaborations with certain Cervantes centres to organise Galician language courses, the Galician language and culture are not given their rightful place in the cultural policy of the State agencies abroad, i.e. the Ministry for Foreign Affairs, the Ministry for Culture and the Cervantes Institute.

ARTICLE 13. ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL LIFE

¹⁸ <http://praza.gal/cultura/6831/o-numero-de-libros-editados-en-galego-caeu-case-a-metade-en-2013/>

¹⁹ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/546>

Paragraph 1.

In general, paragraphs **a)**, **b)**, **c)** and **d)** are not fulfilled:

The non-fulfillments in this areas cause linguistic discrimination and limit the guarantees to exercise other rights and equal employment opportunities²⁰. Most collective agreements continue not to recognise the language rights of their workforce.

Cases of workplace harassment and bullying for speaking Galician still arise and there is no government action plan in place to prevent this²¹.

While approximately 200 provisions exist requiring the use of Spanish in activities or commercial information aimed at consumers, only one vaguely supports the use of Galician, while failing to establish mechanisms to make it effective.

We have confirmed that certain companies not only fail to provide services to their customers in Galician, but actually prevent the customers from expressing themselves in Galician.

Regarding **Paragraph d)**, contrary to the report submitted by the Government, this period was characterized by a total cut in the grants designed to increase the usage of Galician by businesses as clearly seen when accessing the web of the Language Normalisation Service of the Galician Employers' Confederation, that Spain gives as an example in their report, showing that it was closed due to a lack of backing on the part of the General Secretariat for Language Policy (see: <http://www.normalizacion.ceg.es/>)

Paragraph 2.

b.i) This undertaking is not being fulfilled. Most banks operating in Galiza do not provide banking or financial documents in Galician, nor does any regulation exist to protect the language rights of Galician speakers in this area.

While the erstwhile Galician saving banks (*Caixa Galicia* and *Caixanova*) had taken steps towards incorporating Galician into all of their activities during the previous periods, while maintaining the overall use of Galician in advertising, ATMs, etc., the

²⁰ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/205>; <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/213>

²¹ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/549>

bank that took them over (*Abanca*) has stopped providing Galician versions of many documents, contracts and common procedures, including on-line banking²².

b) This is also not being fulfilled. State-owned companies such as the railroad company and operator (ADIF and RENFE), the telegraph service and the airport authority (AENA) all only use Galician in some of their more formal public documents. However, there has been clear backtracking regarding breaches of Spanish legislation concerning place names and customer services in Galician when requested. There have never been enough staff able to conduct customer services in Galician with no training programs.

The Galician Government does not take into account the use of Galician by companies that sign contracts with the public administration, including the Department for Education and Culture which is responsible for language normalisation, whilst at the same time refusing to use Galician in training activities subcontracted by them.

All special contractual resources must be drafted in Spanish (Spanish Official Gazette, 25 November 2013), something which only occurs in Galiza contrary to the situation for the other official languages in the Spanish State, due to the fact that the Galician Government has handed over its powers to the Spanish government.

c) While Galician is only used formally in part of their signage and documents in the Galician Health Service (SERGAS), most health workers are unable to attend to their patients in Galician²³. This right is not even guaranteed in the case of written communicate, and *A Mesa* has reported extremely serious cases²⁴ where several SERGAS hospitals have delayed surgery for months because patients had asked to sign their consent forms in Galician²⁵. The situation in the private sector is considerably worse, with no use of Galician whatever.

Galician was excluded from the *Portfolio of Social Services* publication and the social services and social workers are experiencing difficulties to do their work because of the development of a model of *Unified Social Report* only available in Spanish.

²² <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/563>

²³ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/309>

²⁴ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/116>; <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/178>

²⁵ <http://amesanl.org/gl/novas/amosar/id/451>

Nursing homes primarily use Spanish in all of their activities, despite the fact that in Galiza the elderly mainly Galician speakers.

d) Nothing has been done to fulfil this goal. Safety warnings in constructionsites, lifts, fire instructions, etc., are usually in Spanish only, and there is no regulation regarding the right to information in Galician.

ARTICLE 14. CROSS-BORDER EXCHANGES

The undertakings described in Paragraphs **a)** and **b)** of this Article are applicable to cross-border exchanges between Galiza and Portugal. Nevertheless, institutional agreements designed to facilitate or encourage contacts between Galiza and Portugal remain insignificant, and the Spanish Government has failed to reach any bilateral agreement with Portugal in this regard. Cooperation between Galician and Portuguese local authorities as well as cooperation headed by the Galician Government are negligible.